





































Lemma 1: Let  $S$  and  $T$  be compact spaces, of which  $S$  is Hausdorff. Let  $\gamma: S \rightarrow \mathcal{C}(T)$  be a map whose graph  $\Gamma = \{(s, t) \in S \times T \mid t \in \gamma(s)\}$  is compact. Then  $\gamma$  is upper semi-continuous.

Proof: Let  $D \subset T$  be closed. Then  $D$  is compact, since  $T$  is so. Since  $S$  is compact,  $S \times D$  is also compact. Thus,  $\Gamma \cap (S \times D)$  is compact, so that its projection  $P$  into  $S$  is compact. But  $P$  is precisely the set  $\{s \in S \mid \gamma(s) \cap D \neq \emptyset\}$ ; and, being compact in the Hausdorff space  $S$ ,  $P$  is closed. This proves that  $\gamma$  is upper semi-continuous.

#



Proposition 2: Let  $X = X_1 \times X_2$  be a non-empty compact space with  $X_2$  Hausdorff; and, for every  $v \in R^X$ , define  $\hat{\alpha}(v): X_2 \rightarrow \mathcal{P}(X_1)$  by

$$\hat{\alpha}(v)(x_2) = \{x_1 \in X_1 \mid v(x_1, x_2) \geq \sup_{X_1} v(\cdot, x_2)\},$$

so that  $v \mapsto \hat{\alpha}(v)$  determines a map  $\hat{\alpha}$  on  $R^X$ . Then

- (1)  $\hat{\alpha}$  maps  $R^X$  into  $\mathcal{C}(X_1)^{X_2}$  [i.e., for each  $v \in R^X$ ,  $\hat{\alpha}(v)$  maps  $X_2$  upper semi-continuously into  $\mathcal{C}(X_1)$ ]; and
- (2)  $\hat{\alpha}: R^X \rightarrow \mathcal{C}(X_1)^{X_2}$  is continuous.

Proof: (ad (1)): Let  $v \in R^X$ . For every  $x_2 \in X_2$ ,  $X_1 \times \{x_2\}$  is compact, so the continuous  $v$  attains a supremum on a non-empty closed subset, specifically on  $\hat{\alpha}(v)(x_2) \times \{x_2\} \subset X_1 \times \{x_2\}$ , whereby  $\hat{\alpha}(v)(x_2) \in \mathcal{C}(X_1)$ , and we see that  $\hat{\alpha}(v)$  maps  $X_2$  into  $\mathcal{C}(X_1)$ . To prove that  $\hat{\alpha}(v): X_2 \rightarrow \mathcal{C}(X_1)$  is upper semi-continuous, using Lemma 1, it suffices to show that the graph  $\hat{\Gamma} = \{(x_2, x_1) \in X \mid x_1 \in \hat{\alpha}(v)(x_2)\}$  is compact, and this we now do. From the continuity of  $v$  and compactness of  $X_1$ , (it is straightforward to show that) the function  $\bar{v}: X_2 \rightarrow R$  determined by  $\bar{v}(x_2) = \sup_{X_1} v(\cdot, x_2)$  is well-defined and continuous. Since  $v$  and  $\bar{v}$  are continuous  $_{X_1}$  and their range is Hausdorff, their graphs  $\Gamma_v = \{(x, r) \in X \times R \mid r = v(x)\}$  and  $\Gamma_{\bar{v}} = \{(x_2, r) \in X_2 \times R \mid r = \bar{v}(x_2)\}$ , respectively, are closed. Also, by continuity of  $v$  and compactness of  $X$ ,  $v(X)$  is compact. Thus, the closed set  $K = (X_1 \times \Gamma_{\bar{v}}) \cap \Gamma_v \subset X \times v(X)$  is compact. Now the projection of  $K$  into  $X$  is precisely the graph  $\hat{\Gamma}$ , so  $\hat{\Gamma}$  is compact and, by Lemma 1, (1) is proved.



(ad (2)): Agreeing on the notation  $\langle P, Q \rangle = \{v \in R^X \mid (p, q) \in P \times Q \Rightarrow v(p) < v(q)\}$  for subsets  $P, Q \subset X$ , first we note that  $\langle P, Q \rangle \subset R^X$  is open when  $P$  and  $Q$  are compact<sup>3</sup>:  $\langle P, Q \rangle$  is just the union  $(\bigcup_{t \in R} ((P, (-\infty, t)) \cap (Q, (t, +\infty)))) \cup (\bigcup_{(\underline{s}, \bar{s}) \in \Omega} ((P, (-\infty, \bar{s})) \cap (Q, (\underline{s}, +\infty))))$ , where<sup>3</sup>  $\Omega = \{(\underline{s}, \bar{s}) \in R \times R \mid \underline{s} < \bar{s} \text{ and there is no } t \in R \text{ with } \underline{s} < t < \bar{s}\}$ .

Take any compact non-empty  $B \subset X_2$  and any non-empty open  $W \subset X_1$ , so that  $(B, \langle W \rangle) \subset C(X_1)^{X_2}$  is a subbasic open set, and take any  $v \in R^X$  such that  $\hat{\alpha}(v) \in (B, \langle W \rangle)$ . Claim (established in the next paragraph): for every  $b \in B$ , there is a relatively compact open nbd  $V(b)$  of  $b$  and a compact set  $K(b) \subset W$  such that  $\langle \bar{V}(b) \times W^c, \bar{V}(b) \times K(b) \rangle$ , where  $W^c = X_1 \setminus W$ , is a nbd of  $v$ . In that case,  $\{V(b) \mid b \in B\}$  is an open cover of  $B$  affording a finite subcover  $\{V(b_i) \mid i = 1, \dots, m\}$ , and it follows that  $G = \bigcap_{i=1}^m \langle \bar{V}(b_i) \times W^c, \bar{V}(b_i) \times K(b_i) \rangle$  is a nbd of  $v$  such that  $\hat{\alpha}(G) \subset (B, \langle W \rangle)$ , showing that  $\hat{\alpha}$  is continuous. To complete the proof, we turn to establish our claim above.

For each  $b \in B$ ,  $v$  attains a supremum  $\bar{s}(b) = \sup_{\{b\} \times W} v$  on  $\{b\} \times W$ , and (since  $W^c$  is compact)  $\underline{s}(b) = \sup_{\{b\} \times W^c} v$  on  $\{b\} \times W^c$ . Now, for all  $b \in B$ ,  $\underline{s}(b) < \bar{s}(b)$  holds, and there are just two possibilities: (i)  $R$  owns an element  $t(b)$  such that  $\underline{s}(b) < t(b) < \bar{s}(b)$ , and (ii)  $R$  owns no such element. If (i) holds, define  $T_*(b) = (-\infty, t(b))$  and  $T^*(b) = (t(b), +\infty)$ . As these are both open sets and  $v$  continuous, taking any  $w(b) \in W$  with  $v(b, w(b)) \in T^*(b)$ , using (local) compactness of  $X$ , we may find a relatively compact open box nbd  $V_1(b) \times U(b)$  of  $(b, w(b))$  such that (the closure)  $\bar{V}_1(b) \times \bar{U}(b) \subset v^{-1}(T^*(b))$ . As  $W^c$  is compact, we may also find a



relatively compact open nbd  $V_2(b)$  of  $b$  such that  $\bar{V}_2(b) \times W^C \subset v^{-1}(T_\star(b))$ .

Thus, writing  $V(b) = V_1(b) \cap V_2(b)$  and  $K(b) = \bar{U}(b)$ ,  $<| \bar{V}(b) \times W^C$ ,

$\bar{V}(b) \times K(b) |>$  is a nbd of  $v$ . If (ii) holds, define  $T_\star(b) = (-\infty, \bar{s}(b))$

and  $T^\star(b) = (\underline{s}(b) + \infty)$ , and find  $V(b)$  and  $K(b)$  as in the case of (i).

This completes the proof.

#





FUNDAMENTAL CONTINUITY THEOREM I: Let  $X = X_1 \times X_2$  and  $Y$  be non-empty topological spaces, of which  $X$  is compact with  $X_2$  Hausdorff, and let  $u \in R^{(X \times Y)}$ . Consider the function  $\alpha_u$  on  $Y^X$  which determines, for each  $g \in Y^X$ , a (unique) map  $\alpha_u(g)$  defined on  $X_2$  by

$$\alpha_u(g)(x_2) = \{x_1 \in X_1 \mid u(x_1, x_2, g(x_1, x_2)) \geq \sup_{X_1} u(\cdot, x_2, g(\cdot, x_2))\}.$$

Then

- (1)  $\alpha_u$  maps  $Y^X$  into  $\mathcal{C}(X_1)^{X_2}$  [i.e., for each  $g \in Y^X$ ,  $\alpha_u(g)$  maps  $X_2$  upper semi-continuously into  $\mathcal{C}(X_1)$ ]; and
- (2)  $\alpha_u$  is continuous.

Proof: (ad (1)): Let  $g \in Y^X$ . By continuity of  $u$ , the function  $\hat{g}_u = \omega_u(g)$  defined in Proposition 1 is continuous, i.e.,  $\hat{g}_u \in R^X$ . Thus, Proposition 2(1) applies, showing that  $\alpha_u(g) = \hat{\alpha}(\hat{g}_u) \in \mathcal{C}(X_1)^{X_2}$ , and (1) is proved.

(ad (2)): Proposition 2(2) shows that  $\alpha_u(g) = \hat{\alpha}(\hat{g}_u)$  is continuous in  $\hat{g}_u$ , and from Proposition 1 we see that  $\hat{g}_u$  is continuous in  $g$  ( $g \in Y^X$ ). Thus, as the composition  $\alpha_u = \hat{\alpha} \circ \omega_u: Y^X \rightarrow \mathcal{C}(X_1)^{X_2}$ ,  $\alpha_u$  is continuous, as to be shown. This completes the proof.



COROLLARY: In Theorem I, the map  $\alpha'_u: Y^X \times X_2 \rightarrow \mathcal{C}(X_1)$  defined by

$$\alpha'_u(g, x_2) = \alpha_u(g)(x_2) \quad (g \in Y^X, x_2 \in X_2)$$

is continuous (in both arguments together).

Proof: From Theorem I, we already see that  $\alpha'_u$  is continuous in each argument ( $g \in Y^X$  and  $x_2 \in X_2$ ) separately. But  $X_2$  is compact, hence locally compact, in which case the result is a well-known consequence<sup>5</sup> of the compact-open topology (on  $\mathcal{C}(X_1)^{X_2}$ ).

#



Lemma 2: Let  $X$ ,  $Y$  and  $Z$  be non-empty topological spaces of which  $X$  and  $Y$  are locally compact.<sup>6</sup> Define the maps  $\mu'$ :  $Z^{X \times Y} \times Y^X \times X \rightarrow Z$  and  $\mu$ :  $Z^{X \times Y} \times Y^X \rightarrow Z^X$  by  $\mu'(u, g, x) = u(x, g(x))$  and  $\mu(u, g)(\cdot) = \mu'(u, g, \cdot)$  ( $u \in Z^{X \times Y}$ ,  $g \in Y^X$ ,  $x \in X$ ). Then

- (1)  $\mu'$  is continuous; and
- (2)  $\mu$ , too, is continuous.

Proof: (ad (1)): Take any  $(u, g, x)$  in the domain of  $\mu'$ , and let  $W \subset Z$  be any open nbd of  $\mu'(u, g, x)$ . Then  $(x, g(x)) \in u^{-1}(W)$ , so continuity of  $u$  yields an open box nbd  $U \times V$  of  $(x, g(x))$  with  $U \subset X$  and  $V \subset Y$  such that  $u(U \times V) \subset W$ . As  $X$  and  $Y$  are locally compact, we may assume  $u(\bar{U} \times \bar{V}) \subset W$ ; and, since  $g$  is continuous, we may also assume that  $g(\bar{U}) \subset V \subset \bar{V}$ . Now we have  $N = (\bar{U} \times \bar{V}, W) \times (\bar{U}, V) \times U$  a nbd of  $(u, g, x)$  with  $\mu'(N) \subset W$ , showing that  $\mu'$  is continuous.

(ad (2)): This follows directly from (1) and the well-known fact that the compact-open topology on  $Z^X$  is always splitting.<sup>7</sup>

#



FUNDAMENTAL CONTINUITY THEOREM II: Let  $X = X_1 \times X_2$  be a non-empty compact space with  $X_2$  Hausdorff, and let  $Y$  be a non-empty locally compact space.<sup>6</sup> Consider the map  $\alpha'$  on  $R^{X \times Y} \times Y^X \times X_2$  defined (with reference to Theorem I) by  $\alpha'(u, g, x_2) = \alpha_u(g)(x_2)$ , and consider the "associate" map  $\alpha$  on  $R^{X \times Y} \times Y^X$  determined by  $\alpha(u, g) = \alpha_u(g)$  ( $u \in R^{X \times Y}$ ,  $g \in Y^X$ ,  $x_2 \in X_2$ ). Then  $\alpha'$  is into  $\mathcal{C}(X_1)$  and  $\alpha$  is into  $\mathcal{C}(X_1)^{X_2}$ , and both maps

$$\begin{aligned}\alpha' &: R^{X \times Y} \times Y^X \times X_2 \rightarrow \mathcal{C}(X_1) \\ \alpha &: R^{X \times Y} \times Y^X \rightarrow \mathcal{C}(X_1)^{X_2}\end{aligned}$$

are continuous.

Proof: In Lemma 2(2), set  $Z = R$ . Then  $\mu: R^{X \times Y} \times Y^X \rightarrow R^X$  is continuous. Also, using Proposition 2,  $\hat{\alpha}: R^X \rightarrow \mathcal{C}(X_1)^{X_2}$  is continuous. Now, clearly,  $\alpha = \hat{\alpha} \circ \mu: R^{X \times Y} \times Y^X \rightarrow \mathcal{C}(X_1)^{X_2}$  is continuous and  $\alpha'$  is into  $\mathcal{C}(X_1)$ . Since  $X_2$  is compact, hence locally compact, the compact-open topology on  $\mathcal{C}(X_1)^{X_2}$  is conjoining,<sup>7</sup> so  $\alpha'$ , too, is continuous. This completes the proof.





Historical Note: An earlier study of the continuity of the set of optimal solutions is [Dantzig, Folkman and Shapiro, 1967]. It works with feasible regions lying in a metric space and with objective functions coinciding with real-valued incentive functions, and takes the "parameter space"  $X_2$  as singleton, investigating the continuity of the set of optimal solutions as a function of (i) objective function used and (ii) feasible region. Thus, neither does it contain, nor is it contained in, the present study.

In a paper following the present and [Sertel, 1971a], we intend to study the continuity of the set of optimal solutions as a function of the feasible region as well. (The present study extends a corrected version of the author's "The Fundamental Continuity Theory of Optimization on a Compact Hausdorff Space", Alfred P. Sloan School of Management, Working Paper 620-72, October, 1972.)



# FOOTNOTES

0. Our notation  $R$  is intended to be mnemonic of the real line, i.e., the set of all real numbers taken with the usual (Euclidean) topology, since objective functions in the literature are almost always specified as real-valued. (N.B. The usual topology on the set of reals coincides, of course, with the order topology, using the natural order of the reals). Thus, the reader may wish to interpret  $R$ , throughout this paper, as the real line; mathematically, (s)he is quite free to do so.
1. A terminological warning may be in order. For, according to a terminology not used here, a mapping into a space of non-empty closed sets is called "continuous" iff it is continuous when the range space is given its "finite" topology (see [Michael, 1951]), a topology finer than the upper semi-finite. When we are given a map of a topological space into a space of non-empty closed sets and the topology on the range is understood (e.g., to be the upper semi-finite), we feel free to speak of the map as continuous iff it is so w.r.t. the topology on the domain and that on the range!
2. Note that a function  $\Psi^*: S \rightarrow \mathcal{C}(T)$  which is singleton-valued (i.e., such that, for each  $s \in S$ ,  $\Psi^*(s)$  is a one-element set) is upper semi-continuous iff the function  $\Psi: S \rightarrow T$ , defined by  $\Psi^*(s) = \{\Psi(s)\}$  ( $s \in S$ ), is continuous.
3. Denoting  $(R \times R) \setminus \geq$  by  $<$ , by  $(-\infty, \bar{s})$  we mean  $\{r \in R \mid r < \bar{s}\}$  and by  $(\underline{s}, +\infty)$  we mean  $\{r \in R \mid \underline{s} < r\}$ .
4. Strictly speaking, as made clear in announcing our Aim,  $\alpha_u$  is on  $\{u\} \times Y^X$  and  $\alpha_u(g) = \alpha'(u, g)$ . As  $\{u\} \times Y^X$  is homeomorphic to  $Y^X$ , our informality in treating  $\alpha_u$  as a map on  $Y^X$  should cause no error.
5. See, e.g., Theorem 3.1 (2) on pp. 261 of [Dugundji, 1966].
6. Notice that, if  $Y$  is the real line, it is locally compact. The relevance of this is that our theorem may be applied in the study of optimization subject to real-valued (e.g., monetary) incentive functions, such as in the usual economic case: e.g., the case of taxes or subsidies, the case of wages or salaries, and the general case of a price system.
7. See § 10 of Ch. XII in [Dugundji, 1966].



REFERENCES

1. [Dantzig, Folkman and Shapiro, 1967].

Dantzig, G. B., J. Folkman and N. Shapiro, "On the Continuity of the Minimum Set of a Continuous Function", Journal of Mathematical Analysis and Applications, 17, 1967, pp. 519-548.

2. [Debreu, 1954].

Debreu, G., "Representation of a Preference Ordering by a Numerical Function," Ch. XI in Thrall, R.M., C.H. Coombs and R.L. Davis (eds.), Decision Processes, (New York, 1954).

3. [Dugundji, 1966].

Dugundji, J., Topology, (Allyn & Bacon, Boston, 1966).

4. [Michael, 1951].

Michael, E., "Topologies on Spaces of Subsets", Transactions of the American Mathematical Society, 71, 1951, pp. 152-182.

5. [Sertel, 1971a].

Sertel, M.R., "Elements of Equilibrium Methods for Social Analysis," unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, M.I.T., January, 1971.

6. [Sertel, 1971b].

Sertel, M.R., "Order, Topology and Preference," Alfred P. Sloan School of Management, M.I.T., Working Paper 565-71, October, 1971.





84565611

Date Due

DEC 01 72

MAY

JUN 7 73

NOV 07

NOV 07 81

SEP 14

APR 01 1991

Lib-26-67



-J5 143 w no.624- 72  
ry, Ronald Eu/The accelerated summer  
636659 D\*BKS 00028904



3 9080 000 761 681

MIT LIBRARIES



9080 003 670 897

HD28.M414 no.626- 72a  
Zannetos, Zeno/The economic impact of  
637016 D\*BKS 00027782



3 9080 000 748 357

MIT LIBRARIES



3 9080 004 667 322

HD28.M414 no.629-72  
Sertel, Murat /The fundamental continu  
637018 D\*BKS 00027759



3 9080 000 747 755

MIT LIBRARIES



3 9080 003 701 940

MIT LIBRARIES



3 9080 003 670 921

MIT LIBRARIES



3 9080 003 671 911

MIT LIBRARIES

DUPL



3 9080 003 701 965

MIT LIBRARIES

DUPL



3 9080 003 670 996

